

REVIEW



Regenerative endodontics: repair or true regeneration? A narrative review

Eman Maged Fouad

Department of Oral and Dental Surgery, Misr University for Science and Technology, Giza, Egypt

ABSTRACT

Regenerative endodontics therapy (RET) is a pioneering approach in dentistry that aims to restore damaged dental pulp and promote tissue regeneration in non-vital teeth. It belongs to the broader field of regenerative medicine, where stem cells, scaffolds, and bioactive molecules are central components. The goal of RET is to achieve true tissue regeneration, fully restoring both the structure and function of damaged tissues, in contrast to repair, which only restores basic functionality through scar formation or tissue remodeling. Histological studies conducted in various research models, ranging from animal studies to human case studies, have provided valuable insights into the nature of tissue regeneration in RET. However, the quality of regenerated tissue can vary significantly among studies. Some research reports have described the presence of fibrous or fibrovascular tissue with limited functionality, resembling repair rather than true regeneration. This variation can be attributed to the impact of disinfection protocols on stem cell viability and differentiation potential. In conclusion, RET has the potential for both repair and true regeneration processes, with outcomes influenced by factors such as disinfection methods and the source of stem cells. Despite the remaining challenges, promising results suggest that RET could revolutionize dental pulp regeneration, especially when approaches that utilize the body's stem cells are optimized for clinical use. Further research and protocol refinement is essential to fully unlock the regenerative potential of this exciting field.

KEYWORDS

Regenerative endodontics;
Repair; Regeneration;
Histologic studies

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received 23 September
2023; Revised 30 October
2023; Accepted 6 November
2023

Introduction

Regenerative endodontics therapy (RET) is a relatively recent innovative concept that aims to restore damaged dental pulp, promoting tissue regeneration within the root canal system in non-vital teeth. This concept belongs to the wide umbrella of regenerative medicine that relies on the interplay of the triode: stem cells and scaffold under the influence of bioactive molecules [1]. The innovative approach of pulp regeneration is categorized into two main approaches depending on the source of the progenitor cells, namely cell-based or cell homing. Cell-based RET depends on a sophisticated implementation technique of transplanted stem cells, while cell homing encourages endogenous triggered stem cells to repopulate pulp space and undergo further proliferation and differentiation [2]. True regeneration is the ultimate goal to yield successful outcomes. It involves the process of restoring damaged tissues to their original state, both structurally and functionally. This is opposed by the concept of repair, which only restores functionality through scar formation or tissue remodeling. Studies have shown RET to be effective in promoting healing and root development in immature teeth [3], and it may also be beneficial in mature teeth with chronic periapical lesions [4]. However, the extent to which RET can achieve true regeneration of the pulp-dentin complex is still under debate. Does it truly achieve tissue regeneration or merely facilitate repair?

Translational Research

Histological studies have provided valuable insights into the nature of the newly formed tissue in regenerative endodontics. The current available body of evidence mainly draws conclusions from animal studies [5]. The available body of

evidence suggests the feasibility and effectiveness of orthotopic animal models where larger animal models, such as dogs [6-9], are preferred over smaller ones like rats [10-12]. Dogs still represent a more reproducible and meaningful insight as their teeth pose high similarity to human anatomy [13,14]. In addition, the literature includes semi-orthotropic studies where safety, biological response, and effectiveness could be evaluated in which the intervention of transplanting experimental samples is carried out either subcutaneously or inferior to the renal capsule [15].

Noteworthy, the quality of the regenerated tissue can vary widely. Some studies have reported the presence of fibrous or fibrovascular tissue with limited functionality, resembling repair rather than true regeneration. The conclusion drawn by a systematic review published in 2017 confirmed the reparative nature of the newly formed tissue. Among the thirteen reviewed histological studies that could meet the inclusion criteria of the authors, less than 5% of studies could reveal true dentine formation, and the majority of the root canal dentinal walls were laid down by cementum or bone rather than dentin [16]. The argument of the fibrous nature of the newly infiltrating soft tissue, which differs from native dental pulp architecture, was particularly true for abundant research work. Such configuration was shown by Stambolsky et al., El-Tayeb et al., Ghoddusi et al., and Pagliarin et al. [9,17-19]. The deposition of cementum, as well as bone, is obvious in most of the literature [20]. Both cellular and acellular cementum were laid down on preexisting walls juxtaposed with fibrous tissue and were responsible for root thickening and elongation [21].

*Correspondence: Dr. Eman Maged Fouad, Lecturer, Department of Oral and Dental Surgery, Misr University for Science and Technology, Giza, Egypt, e-mail: eman-8012@hotmail.com

© 2024 The Author(s). Published by Reseapro Journals. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

In contrast, some histological evidence suggests that true regeneration is achievable in some cases. Despite the scarcity of such evidence, they still represent a great promise for the future, where true regenerative processes could be carried out with the clinically feasible approach of cell homing. Limited areas of “true regenerated tissue” were described by Palma et al., reflecting on the presence of newly formed dentin surrounded by odontoblast-like cells. However, the findings were not attributed to the surviving odontoblasts [22]. The research of Yoo et al. consolidated the pulp-like appearance where newly formed hard tissue was lined by more rounded palisading odontoblast-like cells when disinfection was carried out with a synthetic human beta defensin-3-C15 rather than the calcium hydroxide or antibiotic paste [6]. Pulp regeneration was also evident in the study conducted by El Ashiry et al. The described dentinal architecture suggested a regenerative process linked to the transplanted autologous stem cell construct. However, the configuration of well-organized dentinal tubules was lacking except for some areas, with occasional cell entrapment. This architecture was not evident in samples devoid of stem cell seeding [8].

Studies of Human Subjects

Valuable insights could be gained from several case studies that evaluated the nature of the newly infiltrated soft tissue in human subjects. These data were gained from teeth that underwent RET and have been subsequently extracted for various reasons, such as root fractures or orthodontic reasons [20]. It was well acknowledged that regenerative procedures can lead to the formation of pulp-like tissue within the root canal space. This tissue often contains cells resembling odontoblasts and endothelial cells, and it may show signs of vascularization and innervation. In a recent study, the long-term impact of RET was assessed through histologic evaluation of lower premolars with dens evaginatus extracted four years after the regenerative procedure. The radiographic evidence of root elongation and wall thickening was correlated with cementum deposition along dentinal walls, with varying thickness and texture, in addition to the fibrous tissue ingrowth and inflammatory cell infiltrates [23]. The fibrous neo-formed soft tissue resembled the periodontal ligament with flattened or no cells lining the newly deposited hard tissue for most cases [24-27]. Such histopathological interpretation added to the accumulated body of evidence, suggesting the reparative nature of the procedure.

Conversely, histological assessment of the newly infiltrated soft tissue 3.5 weeks after the revascularization procedure revealed a pulp-similar architecture with flattened cells lining along the predentin. Despite the findings being early and non-conclusive, the regenerative potentiality of the revascularization was confirmed in immature roots with irreversible pulpitis [28]. Furthermore, the histological and topographical examination of surgically resected root fragments after sixteen years of RET revealed a configuration similar to the native tooth structure [29]. Surface topography indicated the opening of dentinal tubules of the dentin-like structure together with cellular cementum abundance. Such findings confirm the regenerative potential of the process. These variations in tissue composition and functionality suggest that RET may encompass both repair and true regeneration processes. Unfortunately, available data from the current literature is still non-conclusive and consensus despite

the high interest in the biologically based procedure that is reflected in the bibliometric analysis of published articles [30]. Although histological studies deny the true regeneration of the pulp-dentin complex in the strictest sense, it does appear to promote a form of repair that functionally mimics the pulp-dentin complex, and the promoted healing supported clinical successful outcomes is acknowledged in the available literature.

Several factors can significantly influence the outcome of regenerative endodontic procedures and tilt the balance towards true dentin formation rather than a mere reparative process.

Effect of infection

Achieving successful pulp regeneration requires a more thorough level of disinfection compared to standard root canal procedures. It is imperative to emphasize that while traditional root canal treatment can lead to the resolution of periapical disease, even when some bacteria remain, the same might not hold for regenerative endodontics [31]. This aspect is of particular significance since the young, aged dentin in immature roots is shown to harbor bacterial invasion and allow for deeper bacterial penetration through dentinal tubules [32].

Unacceptable outcomes are strongly associated with the level of infection, both in translational and clinical studies [33,34]. The evidence consolidated the adverse effect of long-standing infection and bacterial contamination on the regenerative process. This is reflected through the significantly lowest gene expression of dentin sialophosphoprotein (DSPP) associated with 12 weeks of infection compared to one week, as well as immunohistochemical analysis [35]. Herein, gaining adequate disinfection is crucial in regenerative endodontics, as residual infection can impede the pulp regeneration process, leading to unfavorable outcomes. Effective disinfection ensures a conducive environment for successful tissue regeneration within the root canal system.

Effect of disinfection protocols

It is noteworthy that common disinfection protocol depends on harsh antibacterial medicaments such as calcium hydroxide or a mixture of antibiotic paste [36]. Such a mixture of antibiotics could counteract the physiologic existence and functionality of stem cells [37]. Its negative impact on stem cell viability and odontogenic differentiation is well-proven and is concentration-dependent [38]. The implemented toxicity extends even after root canal flushing, and remnants of antibiotic paste could interfere with the repopulation and attachment of progenitor cells, a critical part of the regenerative process [39,40]. The results of Ferreira et al. have proven the least release of transforming growth factor beta (TGF- β), an essential growth factor involved in dentinogenesis and triggers the differentiation of odontoblasts [40].

Presence of remnants of pulp tissue

The histological configuration of the intracanal tissue ingrowth was revealed to be close to normal pulp architecture in the experimental group where the pulp tissue was amputated partially rather than full pulpectomy. The histopathological configuration was attributed to the effect of residual pulp tissue and intact progenitor cells of epithelial

root sheath of Hertwig or dental papilla, augmented with the inductive nature of highly growth factors loaded scaffold [41]. In the same context, pulp remnants in immature mandibular premolars were correlated to the configuration of regenerated pulp-like tissue. Histologically, the apical third of the root canal contained newly formed dentin-like and pulp-like tissue with odontoblast-like cells, transitioning to cementum-like tissue in the midportion, and cementocyte-like cells in the upper third of the root canal, surrounded by loose connective tissue [42]. Moreover, despite complete pulp amputation being intended, remnants of pulp could be left behind. This technique was further augmented through the application of photobiomodulation via low-power laser. Together, they managed to yield the histological configuration of pulp-like tissue texture revealed by Moreira et al. [12].

Effect of scaffold

Implementing platelet concentrates scaffolds like platelet-rich plasma or fibrin has gained a high interest in current literature due to the autologous nature and the speculated regenerative power due to high growth factor content. Nevertheless, a systematic assessment of published histological data revealed no advantage over conventional blood clot scaffolds. Tissue in-growth remains poorly characterized with little similarity to normal dentino-pulpal soft and hard tissue configuration [43].

Nonetheless, the newly introduced decellularized dental pulp matrix functionalized hydrogel approved great regenerative potential for pulp regeneration. This scaffold, by default, contains an abundance of bioactive molecules that actively interact with the regenerative approach [44].

Conclusions

Current literature reveals that while regenerative endodontics holds promise for achieving true regeneration, it is not consistently observed in all cases. Some studies have reported histological evidence supporting true regeneration, with the presence of dentin-like tissue and well-differentiated pulp cells. In contrast, others have reported outcomes resembling repair, with the formation of fibrous tissue and limited pulp-like characteristics.

Acknowledgment

The author would like to express sincere appreciation to Aalaa E. Eldessoky, Department of Endodontics, Faculty of Dental Medicine for Girls, Al-Azhar University, for the invaluable support, insightful input, and contributions to this scientific review article.

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author.

References

1. Wei X, Yang M, Yue L, Huang D, Zhou X, Wang X, et al. Expert consensus on regenerative endodontic procedures. *Int J Oral Sci.* 2022;14(1):55. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41368-022-00206-z>
2. Eramo S, Natali A, Pinna R, Milia E. Dental pulp regeneration via cell homing. *Int Endod J.* 2018;51(4):405-419. <https://doi.org/10.1111/iej.12868>
3. Fouad EM, Fawzy MI, Elhousiny MA, Saafan AM, Abdel Ghani SA. Effect of biostimulation on response of immature teeth with necrotic pulp and apical periodontitis to regenerative endodontic therapy in immature dogs teeth. *Al-Azhar Dent J Girls.* 2022;9(2):265-276. <https://doi.org/10.21608/adjg.2022.103757.1445>
4. Eldessoky AE, Khalefa MM, Abu-Seida AM. Regenerative endodontic therapy in mature teeth with necrotic pulp and apical periodontitis using two disinfection protocols. *BMC Oral Health.* 2023;23(1):163. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12903-023-02863-w>
5. Rosa V, Sriram G, McDonald N, Cavalcanti BN. A critical analysis of research methods and biological experimental models to study pulp regeneration. *Int Endod J.* 2022;55:446-455. <https://doi.org/10.1111/iej.13712>
6. Yoo YJ, Perinpanayagam H, Choi Y, Gu Y, Chang SW, Baek SH, et al. Characterization of histopathology and microbiota in contemporary regenerative endodontic procedures: still coming up short. *J Endod.* 2021;47(8):1285-1293. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2021.05.006>
7. El Halaby HM, Abu-Seida AM, Fawzy MI, Farid MH, Bastawy HA. Evaluation of the regenerative potential of dentin conditioning and naturally derived scaffold for necrotic immature permanent teeth in a dog model. *Int J Exp Pathol.* 2020;101(6):264-276. <https://doi.org/10.1111/iep.12372>
8. Abdelsalam N, Abu-Seida AM, Fayyad D, Tawfik H. Radiographic and histopathologic outcomes of immature dog teeth with apical periodontitis after revascularization using propolis. An in vivo study. *Saudi Endod J.* 2020;10(3):199-207. http://doi.org/10.4103/sej.sej_178_19
9. El-Tayeb MM, Abu-Seida AM, El Ashry SH, El-Hady SA. Evaluation of antibacterial activity of propolis on regenerative potential of necrotic immature permanent teeth in dogs. *BMC Oral Health.* 2019;19(1):174. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12903-019-0835-0>
10. Moreira MS, Diniz IM, Rodrigues MFSD, de Carvalho RA, de Almeida Carrer FC, Neves II, et al. In vivo experimental model of orthotopic dental pulp regeneration under the influence of photo biomodulation therapy. *J Photochem Photobiol B.* 2017;166(1):180-186. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.jphotobiol.2016.11.022>
11. Zaccara IM, Jardine AP, Mestieri LB, Quintana RM, Jesus L, Moreira MS, et al. Influence of photobiomodulation therapy on root development of rat molars with open apex and pulp necrosis. *Braz Oral Res.* 2019;33:e084. <https://doi.org/10.1590/1807-3107bor-2019.vol33.0084>
12. Moreira MS, Sarra G, Carvalho GL, Gonçalves F, Caballero-Flores HV, Pedroni AC, et al. Physical and biological properties of a chitosan hydrogel scaffold associated to photobiomodulation therapy for dental pulp regeneration: an in vitro and in vivo study. *Biomed Res Int.* 2021;2021. <https://doi.org/10.1155/2021/6684667>
13. Louvrier A, Terranova L, Meyer C, Meyer F, Euvrard E, Kroemer M, et al. Which experimental models and explorations to use in regenerative endodontics? a comprehensive review on standard practices. *Mol Biol Rep.* 2021;48(4):3799-3812. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11033-021-06299-9>
14. Tawfik H, Abu-Seida AM, Hashem AA, Nagy MM. Regenerative potential following revascularization of immature permanent teeth with necrotic pulps. *Int Endod J.* 2013;46(10):910-922. <https://doi.org/10.1111/iej.12079>
15. Ohlsson E, Galler KM, Widbiller M. A compilation of study models for dental pulp regeneration. *Int J Mol Sci.* 2022;23(22):14361. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijms232214361>
16. Altai M, Richards L, Rossi-Fedele G. Histological assessment of regenerative endodontic treatment in animal studies with different scaffolds: a systematic review. *Dent Traumatol.* 2017;33(4):235-244. <https://doi.org/10.1111/edt.12338>
17. Stambolsky C, Rodríguez-Benítez S, Gutiérrez-Pérez JL, Torres-Lagares D, Martín-González J, Segura-Egea JJ. Histologic characterization of regenerated tissues after pulp revascularization of immature dog teeth with apical periodontitis using tri-antibiotic paste and platelet-rich plasma. *Arch Oral Biol.* 2016;71:122-128. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.archoralbio.2016.07.007>
18. Ghoddusi J, Maghsudlu A, Jafarzadeh H, Jafarian A, Forghani M. Histological evaluation of the effect of platelet-rich plasma on pulp

- regeneration in nonvital open apex teeth: an animal study. *J Contemp Dent Pract.* 2017;18(11):1045-1050.
<https://doi.org/10.5005/jp-journals-10024-2173>
19. Pagliarin CML, Londero C de LD, Felipe MCS, Felipe WT, Danesi CC, Barletta FB. Tissue characterization following revascularization of immature dog teeth using different disinfection pastes. *Braz Oral Res.* 2016;30(1):e74.
<https://doi.org/10.1590/1807-3107BOR-2016.vol30.0074>
20. Digka A, Sakka D, Lyroutdia K. Histological assessment of human regenerative endodontic procedures (REP) of immature permanent teeth with necrotic pulp/apical periodontitis: a systematic review. *Aust Endod J.* 2020;46(1):140-153.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/aej.12371>
21. Wang X, Thibodeau B, Trope M, Lin LM, Huang GT. Histologic characterization of regenerated tissues in canal space after the revitalization/revascularization procedure of immature dog teeth with apical periodontitis. *J Endod.* 2010;36(1):56-63.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2009.09.039>
22. Palma PJ, Ramos JC, Martins JB, Diogenes A, Figueiredo MH, Ferreira P, et al. Histologic evaluation of regenerative endodontic procedures with the use of chitosan scaffolds in immature dog teeth with apical periodontitis. *J Endod.* 2017;43(8):1279-1287.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2017.03.005>
23. Kaur K, Varghese E, Eswara U, En JGP. Histologic and radiological observations of a human immature premolar with pulp necrosis treated with regenerative endodontic procedure – A case report of a four-year follow-up. *Saudi Dent J.* 2023;35(7):869-875.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sdentj.2023.08.002>
24. Meschi N, Hilkens P, Lambrichts I, Van den Eynde K, Mavridou A, Srijbos O, et al. Regenerative endodontic procedure of an infected immature permanent human tooth: an immunohistological study. *Clin Oral Investig.* 2016;20:807-814.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s00784-015-1555-8>
25. Austah O, Joon R, Fath WM, Chrepa V, Diogenes A, Ezeldeen M, et al. Comprehensive characterization of 2 immature teeth treated with regenerative endodontic procedures. *J Endod.* 2018;44(12):1802-1811. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2018.09.007>
26. Shetty H, Shetty S, Kakade A, Desai R, Zhang CF, Neelakantan P. Cone-beam computed tomographic and histological investigation of regenerative endodontic procedure in an immature mandibular second premolar with chronic apical abscess. *J Investig Clin Dent.* 2018;9(4):e12352. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jicd.12352>
27. Lin LM, Shimizu E, Gibbs JL, Loghin S, Ricucci D. Histologic and histobacteriologic observations of failed revascularization/revitalization therapy: a case report. *J Endod.* 2014;40(2):291-295.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2013.08.024>
28. Shimizu E, Jong G, Partridge N, Rosenberg PA, Lin LM. Histologic observation of a human immature permanent tooth with irreversible pulpitis after revascularization/regeneration procedure. *J Endod.* 2012;38(9):1293-1297.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2012.06.017>
29. Kwon SK, Kyeong M, Adasooriya D, Cho SW, Jung IY. Histologic and electron microscopic characterization of a human immature permanent premolar with chronic apical abscess 16 years after regenerative endodontic procedures. *J Endod.* 2023;49(8):1051-1057. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2023.05.017>
30. Adnan S, Ullah R. Top-cited articles in regenerative endodontics: a bibliometric analysis. *J Endod.* 2018;44(11):1650-1664.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2018.07.015>
31. Fouad AF. Microbial factors and antimicrobial strategies in dental pulp regeneration. *J Endod.* 2017;43(9):S46-S50.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2017.06.010>
32. Kakoli P, Nandakumar R, Romberg E, Arola D, Fouad AF. The effect of age on bacterial penetration of radicular dentin. *J Endod.* 2009;35(1):78-81. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2008.10.004>
33. Alexander A, Torabinejad M, Vahdati SA, Nosrat A, Verma P, Grandhi A, et al. Regenerative endodontic treatment in immature noninfected ferret teeth using blood clot or synoss putty as scaffolds. *J Endod.* 2020;46(2):209-215.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2019.10.029>
34. Botero TM, Tang X, Gardner R, Hu JCC, Boynton JR, Holland GR. Clinical evidence for regenerative endodontic procedures: immediate versus delayed induction? *J Endod.* 2017;43(9):S75-S81. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2017.07.009>
35. Iranmanesh P, Torabinejad M, Saatchi M, Toghraie D, Razavi SM, Khademi A. Effect of duration of root canal infection on the ability of dentin-pulp complex regeneration of immature permanent teeth: an animal study. *J Endod.* 2022;48(10):1301-1307.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2022.07.007>
36. Ribeiro JS, Münchow EA, Bordini EA, da Rosa WL, Bottino MC. Antimicrobial therapeutics in regenerative endodontics: a scoping review. *J Endod.* 2020;46(9):S115-S127.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2020.06.032>
37. Labban N, Yassen GH, Windsor LJ, Platt JA. The direct cytotoxic effects of medicaments used in endodontic regeneration on human dental pulp cells. *Dent Traumatol.* 2014;30(6):429-434.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/edt.12108>
38. Raddall G, Mello I, Leung BM. Effects of intracanal antimicrobials on viability and differentiation of stem cells from the apical papilla: an in vitro study. *J Endod.* 2022;48(7):880-886.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2022.04.003>
39. Althumairy RI, Teixeira FB, Diogenes A. Effect of dentin conditioning with intracanal medicaments on survival of stem cells of apical papilla. *J Endod.* 2014;40(4):521-525.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2013.11.008>
40. Ferreira LN, Puppini-Rontani RM, Pascon FM. Effect of intracanal medicaments and irrigants on the release of transforming growth factor beta 1 and vascular endothelial growth factor from cervical root dentin. *J Endod.* 2020;46(11):1616-1622.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2020.07.034>
41. Ezzat A, Adawy HA, Abd Allah MF. Regenerative potentiality of concentrated growth factors with partially and completely amputated pulp tissue (histological study). *Al-Azhar dent j girls.* 2022;9(2):303-310.
<https://doi.org/10.21608/adjg.2022.76009.1376>
42. Peng C, Zhao Y, Wang W, Yang Y, Qin M, Ge L. Histologic findings of a human immature revascularized/regenerated tooth with symptomatic irreversible pulpitis. *J Endod.* 2017;43(6):905-909.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joen.2017.01.031>
43. Riaz A, Shah FA. Regenerating the pulp–dentine complex using autologous platelet concentrates: a critical appraisal of the current histological evidence. *Tissue Eng Regen Med.* 2021;18(1):37-48.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s13770-020-00291-3>
44. Adanir N, Khurshid Z, Ratnayake J. The regenerative potential of decellularized dental pulp extracellular matrix: a systematic review. *Materials.* 2022;15(18):6386.
<https://doi.org/10.3390/ma15186386>